Minutes
T11.3 FC-FS-6 ad hoc work group regular meeting
08 February 2023 – 02:30PM – 05:00PM MST
Tucson, AZ (Hybrid)

The FC-FS-6 ad hoc work group of the Fibre Channel Protocol (T11.3) Task Group held a regular meeting in Tucson, AZ hosted by FCIA along with virtual conferencing facilities using the Zoom platform provided by Marvell on 08 February 2023. Attendance was 15 people from 8 organizations and is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Patty Driever (IBM) (pgd@us.ibm.com). Corrections may be requested either before the subsequent meeting by email to pgd@us.ibm.com or at the subsequent meeting in person.

1 Opening remarks & Introductions

Chairperson Dave Peterson (Broadcom) opened the regular meeting Wednesday, 08 December 2023 at 02:32 PM MST. He thanked our in-person host organization, FCIA, along with Marvell for providing the Zoom meeting facilities, and led a round of introductions.

1.1 Attendance and Membership

The chair explained that attendance is recorded electronically at www.incits.org and explained the procedure. Attendance at this meeting does not count toward attendance at the plenaries of T11 and its task groups (i.e., being here will not get you out or keep you out of membership jeopardy). The chair stated that all persons present are considered members of this meeting and may vote on questions, limited to one vote per company present. He advised that although T11 does not limit participation in the activities of its work groups to representatives of T11 member organizations, it requires nonmembers to identify themselves as such. Nonmembers that expect they may participate in the activities of T11 regularly were encouraged to become members.

1.2 Code of Conduct

The chair referenced the INCITS Code of Conduct and suggested everyone become familiar with its content. It can be found on the INCITS website at the following link:
https://standards.incits.org/apps/group_public/document.php?document_id=124850&wg_abbrev=eb

It will be reviewed at the plenary meetings and in all Ad Hoc meetings as well.

1.3 Patents

The chair indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the ANSI intellectual property policies as specified in pages 1-3 of http://www.incits.org/pat_slides.pdf. He displayed these pages without comment or explanation, and directed that questions about the policy should be referred to the questioner's legal counsel or the ANSI General Counsel.

1.4 Antitrust

The chair indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the INCITS Antitrust Guidelines. Any member of the meeting is responsible for objecting if he believes discussion in the meeting violates those guidelines. As examples, there should never be discussion of the following topics at any INCITS or INCITS subgroup meeting:

• Any company's prices or pricing policies;
• Specific R&D, sales and marketing plans;
• Any company's confidential product, product development or production strategies;
• Whether certain suppliers or customers will be served;
• Prices paid to input sources; or
• Complaints about individual firms or other actions that might tend to hinder a competitor in any market.

If such discussion is not immediately terminated, it is the chairperson's responsibility to terminate the meeting. The INCITS Antitrust Guidelines are available at http://www.incits.org/inatrust.htm.

2 Approval of Agenda

An agenda for the FC-FS-6 ad hoc work group regular meeting 08 February 2023 has been posted as T11-2023-00004-v000.

Patty Driever (IBM) moved and Jason Rusch (Viavi) seconded to accept T11-2023-00004-v000 as the agenda for this regular meeting. Approved unanimously.

3 Review of Past Business

3.1 Review of Minutes

Minutes for the FC-FS-6 ad hoc work group regular meeting 07 December 2022 have been posted as T11/2022-00376-v000.

Patty noted that the date of the meeting in the first paragraph of the minutes was incorrect as has been updated.

Jason Rusch (Viavi) moved and Fred Knight (NetApp) seconded to accept T11/2022-00376-v000 as modified as the minutes of the FC-FS-6 ad hoc work group meeting on 07 December 2022. Approved unanimously.

3.2 Review of Old Action Items

Action Items Carried Forward:

None

New Action Items Identified Last Meeting:

2212-01 Editor to post T11-2022-00353-v001/R11-2022-00354-v001 with updated comment resolution database (**Completed**)

4 Old Business

4.1 RFC Ballot Comment Resolution (T11-2023-00024-v000/T11-2022-00023-v000) All

Craig presented the list of RFC comments received. We received 81 technical and 103 editorial comments on the draft standard for a total of 184 total comments. Over the course of the day we reviewed several of the comments, the database was updated with the results, and we will continue next time.

4.1.1 Comment Resolution (T11-2023-00017-v001) Oteyza (Marvell)

Raul presented a resolution for 6 comments that at the last meeting we agreed further clarification was needed and a resolution to them needed to be proposed.
BSN-39, MRVL-RO-032, CISCO-xiazhu-003, CISCO-xiazhu-004, CISCO-xiazhu-005 and CISCO-xiazhu-006.
BSN-39: Anil, Xiahong and Raul worked on the revised wording and agreed to it. One minor formatting change was made to this text.
MRVL-RO-032: Text changes along with and a small diagram change was proposed as resolution to this comment. No edits were proposed in the meeting.
CISCO-xiazhu-003: The resolution proposed addresses the first 2 items in this comment (the third was otherwise resolved). No edits were proposed in the meeting.
CISCO-xiazhu-004: The resolution proposed addresses the 4th item in this comment. The rest of the items were otherwise addressed. No edits were proposed in the meeting.
CISCO-xiazhu-005: The resolution addresses the first item in this comment. The second item has otherwise been addressed. No edits were proposed in the meeting.
CISCO-xiazhu-006: The resolution addresses the second and third items in this comment. The first item has otherwise been addressed. No edits were proposed in the meeting.

4.1.2 Comment Resolution (T11-2023-00037-v000) Wu (Cisco)

CISCO-xiazhu-001: Cisco agrees that this comment can be rejected.
CISCO-xiazhu-007: Cisco agrees that this comment can be rejected.
CISCO-xiazhu-010: Cisco suggested some text edits. Editor accepts in principle.
CISCO-xiazhu-011: Cisco suggested some text edits. Editor accepts in principle.
CISCO-xiazhu-012: Cisco suggested some text edits. Editor accepts in principle
CISCO-xiazhu-013: Cisco suggested some text edits. Editor accepts in principle.
CISCO-xiaohwu-001: Cisco suggested some text edits. Editor accepts in principle.
CISCO-xiaohwu-003: Cisco suggested some text edits. Editor accepts in principle.

4.1.3 Comment Resolution (T11-2023-00039-v000) Peterson (Broadcom)

Dave introduced a late technical RFC ballot comment Broadcom-late-01. He will come back in April with proposed text to resolve this.
Dave made a motion to add Broadcom-late-01 as a late RFC ballot comment as specified in T11-2023-00066-v000. Motion seconded by Craig Carlson. Motion passed unanimously.

Dave then turned to T11-2023-00039-v000.
BSN-18/BSN-20: Dave presented suggested text edits. Some modifications were made and Dave will post v001 with those included.

Dave Peterson (Broadcom) made a motion to submit a late technical RFC ballot comment Broadcom-late-02 to remove Annex J (Fibre Channel LAN Protocol Support). Motion seconded by Craig Carlson (Marvell). Motion passed unanimously.

Dave then presented a proposed resolution to MRVL-CWC-024. No edits were made.
Dave then presented on a proposed resolution to MRVL-CWC-028. Again, no edits were made.
Dave then moved on to MRVL-CWC-032. There was not agreement on this one, so Craig agreed to look at this one and come back with a new proposal.
On comment MRVL-CWC-036, Dave proposed some text changes as resolution.

Once we completed the above presentations we went back to the Comment Resolution database and continued driving the other comments to closure. More remain.

5.0 New Business

5.1 FC-FS-7 Project Proposal (T11-2023-00002-v000) Peterson (Broadcom)

Dave presented a new project proposal for FC-FS-7. We reviewed the content, with minor modifications made. Dave Peterson (Broadcom) made a motion to accept this FC-FS-7 project proposal as modified (T11-2023-00002-v001) and forward it to T11.3 for further processing. Motion was seconded by Roger Hathorn (IBM). Motion carried unanimously.

6 Unscheduled Business

6.1

7 Project Schedule

Milestone	Expected Date
Last technical input	August 2022
RFC Ballot	October 2022
T11 Letter Ballot	TBD
Forward to INCITS	TBD

8 Review of Action Items

Action Items Carried Forward:

None

New Action Items:

2302-01 Editor to include resolutions posted in T11-2023-00017-v002 as resolution to the 6 identified comments.

2302-02 Editor to include resolutions posted in T11-2023-00037-v000 as resolution to the 8 identified comments.

2302-03 Editor to include Broadcom late RFC ballot comments Broadcom-late-01 and Broadcom-late-02 in the RFC comment resolution database.

2302-04 Editor to include resolutions posted in T11-2023-00039-v001 as resolution to the 7 of the 8 identified comments.

2302-05 Craig Carlson to come back with proposal for resolution to MRVL-CWC-032

2302-06 Chair to forward FC-FS-7 project proposal documented in T11-2022-00002-v000 to T11.3 for further processing

2302-07 Editor to post updated comment resolution document T11-2023-00023-v002

9 Meeting Schedule

9.1 Next Plenary Week

Request 4 hours for FC-FS-6 at the hybrid face-to-face/virtual T11 plenary week 03 April – 07 April 2023.

10 Adjournment

Mike Blair (Cisco) moved to adjourn. Approved unanimously.
The regular meeting was adjourned at 05:56 PM MST on 08 February 2023.

11 Attendance

Organization	Representative	T11.3 Member Company
BROADCOM LIMITED	Howard Johnson	Y
BROADCOM LIMITED	Anil Mehta	Y
BROADCOM LIMITED	David Peterson	Y
BROADCOM LIMITED	James Smart	Y
CISCO SYSTEMS INC	Mike Blair	Y
CISCO SYSTEMS INC	Xiaohong Wu	Y
DELL INC	David Brown	Y
HEWLETT PACKARD ENTERPRISE	Barry Maskas	Y
IBM	Scott Cardinell	Y
IBM	Patty Driever	Y
IBM	Roger Hathorn	Y
MARVELL SEMICONDUCTOR	Craig W. Carlson	Y
MARVELL SEMICONDUCTOR	Raul Oteyza	Y
NETAPP INC	Frederick Knight	Y
VIAVI SOLUTIONS INC	Jason Rusch	Y